



LABOUR & HUMAN RESOURCE DEPARTMENT
DIRECTORATE OF WORKS
PUNJAB WORKERS WELFARE BOARD

F-A/1, Khyber Block, Allama Iqbal Town, Lahore.
Ph:042-99260235, Fax:042-99260243
E-mail:pwwb.works@yahoo.com

No.PWWB/DW-2153-A

Dated 8th June, 2017

FINAL REPORT

Subject: CONSTRUCTION OF WORKERS WELFARE COMPLEX ADJACENT TO SUNDAR INDUSTRIAL ESTATE, DISTRICT KASUR (PACKAGE-A,B,F,G,H,I,J,Q,R & T).

After approval of the scheme, as captioned above, from the Governing Body of Workers Welfare fund, Islamabad in its 128th meeting held on 24.11.2014, necessary formalities like preparation of detailed design & detailed cost estimate etc. were completed. Technical Sanction was accorded by the competent authority and after preparation of BOQs, notice for prequalification of contractors was floated in the press by the Directorate of Works, PWW Board. Notice for prequalification of contractors for the project, based on 20 packages was sent to the DGPR for publication. Detail is as under:-

Notice was published in the following newspapers:-

Sr.#	Name of Newspaper	Date of Publication
1	Daily Nawa-i-Waqt	25.06.2016
2	Daily Pakistan	25.06.2016
3	Daily Dawn	26.06.2016
4	Daily Jurrat	26.06.2016
5	Daily Political Reports	30.06.2016
6	Monthly Urdu Digest	July, 2016

After prequalification of firms, tenders were issued upto 20.03.2017 and were received upto 27.03.2017. Date of receiving of tenders was extended upto 03.04.2017. 10 Nos. of contractor as detailed below purchased the tenders for Packages - A, B, F, G, H, I, J, Q, R & T.

- 1 M/s Progressive International Engineers & Contractor
- 2 M/s Zoraiz Engineers (Pvt) Ltd.
- 3 M/s Construction Group
- 4 M/s Abid Brothers Contractors (Pvt) Ltd.
- 5 M/s Muhammad Rafique Bhatti
- 6 M/s Mian Babar Construction (SMC-Pvt) Ltd.
- 7 M/s Muhammad Asad Contractors
- 8 M/s Saleem & Co.
- 9 M/s Sargodha Group of Construction
- 10 M/s Choudhary Construction Co.

Following firms submitted their financial proposals.

- 1 M/s Progressive International Engineers & Contractor

- 2 M/s Zoraiz Engineers (Pvt) Ltd.
- 3 M/s Construction Group
- 4 M/s Abid Brothers Contractors (Pvt) Ltd.
- 5 M/s Muhammad Rafique Bhatti
- 6 M/s Mian Babar Construction (SMC-Pvt) Ltd.
- 7 M/s Muhammad Asad Contractors
- 8 M/s Sargodha Group of Construction

Financial proposals were opened on 03.04.2017. After opening of financial proposals, financial evaluation has been completed. A detail of each of the package, showing the lowest bidder, is as under:-

A. CONSTRUCTION OF WORKERS WELFARE COMPLEX ADJACENT TO SUNDAR INDUSTRIAL ESTATE, DISTRICT KASUR.

Package-A (Apartments)

Sr. No.	Description	Amount	As per Estimate		M/s Muhammad Rafique Bhatti		M/s Construction Group	
			Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount
1	CIVIL WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	104,694,536	160%	272,205,793	201.00%	315,130,552	200.00%	314,083,607
(b)	Non Schedule Items	3,092,702	0%	3,092,702	15.00%	3,556,607	1.50%	3,139,092
2	PLUMBING WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	3,916,223	160%	10,182,180	201.00%	11,787,831	200.00%	11,748,669
(b)	Non Schedule Items	3,302,440	0%	3,302,440	15.00%	3,797,805	1.50%	3,351,976
3	ELECTRICAL WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	6,327,288	160%	16,450,950	201.00%	19,045,138	200.00%	18,981,865
(b)	Non Schedule Items	2,400,000	0%	2,400,000	15.00%	2,760,000	1.50%	2,436,000
4	GAS INSTALATION							
(a)	Schedule Items	621,760	160%	1,616,576	201.00%	1,871,498	200.00%	1,865,280
		Total Rs.		309,250,640		357,949,432		355,606,490

M/s Construction Group is the lowest bidder and found eligible for award.

Package-B (Apartments)

Sr. No.	Description	Amount	As per Estimate		M/s Construction Group		M/s M. Asad Contractor (Pvt) Ltd.	
			Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount
1	CIVIL WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	115,163,989	160%	299,426,372	200.00%	345,491,968	205.00%	351,250,167
(b)	Non Schedule Items	3,401,972	0%	3,401,972	1.50%	3,453,002	15.00%	3,912,268
2	PLUMBING WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	4,307,845	160%	11,200,398	200.00%	12,923,536	205.00%	13,138,928
(b)	Non Schedule Items	3,632,683	0%	3,632,683	1.50%	3,687,174	15.00%	4,177,586
3	ELECTRICAL WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	6,960,017	160%	18,096,045	200.00%	20,880,052	205.00%	21,228,053
(b)	Non Schedule Items	2,640,000	0%	2,640,000	1.50%	2,679,600	15.00%	3,036,000
4	GAS INSTALATION							
(a)	Schedule Items	683,936	160%	1,778,234	200.00%	2,051,808	205.00%	2,086,005
		Total Rs.		340,175,704		391,167,139		398,829,007

M/s Construction Group is the lowest bidder and found eligible for award.

Package-F (Apartments)

Sr. No.	Description	Amount	As per Estimate		M/s Mian Babar Construction (SMC-Pvt) Ltd.		M/s Construction Group	
			Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount
1	CIVIL WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	125,633,443	160%	326,646,951	220%	402,027,017	225%	408,308,689
(b)	Non Schedule Items	3,711,242	0%	3,711,242	15%	4,267,928	15%	4,267,928
2	PLUMBING WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	4,699,468	160%	12,218,616	220%	15,038,296	225%	15,273,270
(b)	Non Schedule Items	3,962,927	0%	3,962,927	15%	4,557,367	15%	4,557,367
3	ELECTRICAL WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	7,592,746	160%	19,741,140	220%	24,296,788	225%	24,676,425
(b)	Non Schedule Items	2,880,000	0%	2,880,000	15%	3,312,000	15%	3,312,000

4	<u>GAS INSTALATION</u>							
(a)	Schedule Items	746,112	160%	1,939,891	220%	2,387,558	225%	2,424,864
		Total Rs.		371,100,768		455,886,954		462,820,543

- M/s Mian Babar Construction (SMC – Pvt) Ltd. quoted higher rate than the permissible limit of award of work, hence the tender cannot be awarded.
- Contractor given an undertaking on 20.04.2017 for reduction in already quoted rates.
- Action of contractor is against clause-57 captioned as “Limitation on negotiation” of PPRA rules which states that negotiation cannot be done with the contractor.
- Action of the contractor is contradictory to clause IB-22 captioned as “Modification, Substitution and withdrawal of bids” sub clause 22.3 of bidding document of the project, according to which no bid may be modified by a bidder after the deadline for submission of bids.
- The action of the contractor is also contradictory to clause IB-31 captioned as “Notification of Award” sub clause 31.2 of bidding document of the project according to which no negotiation with the bidder having evaluated as lowest responsive or any other bidder shall be permitted.

Package-G (Apartments)

Sr. No.	Description	Amount	As per Estimate		M/s Mian Babar Construction (SMC-Pvt) Ltd.		M/s Zoraiz Engineers (Pvt) Ltd.	
			Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount
1	<u>CIVIL WORKS</u>							
(a)	Schedule Items	125,633,443	160%	326,646,951	220%	402,027,017	223%	405,796,020
(b)	Non Schedule Items	3,711,242	0%	3,711,242	15%	4,267,928	15%	4,267,928
2	<u>PLUMBING WORKS</u>							
(a)	Schedule Items	4,699,468	160%	12,218,616	220%	15,038,296	223%	15,179,280
(b)	Non Schedule Items	3,962,927	0%	3,962,927	15%	4,557,367	15%	4,557,367
3	<u>ELECTRICAL WORKS</u>							
(a)	Schedule Items	7,592,746	160%	19,741,140	220%	24,296,788	223%	24,524,570
(b)	Non Schedule Items	2,880,000	0%	2,880,000	15%	3,312,000	15%	3,312,000
4	<u>GAS INSTALATION</u>							
(a)	Schedule Items	746,112	160%	1,939,891	220%	2,387,558	223%	2,409,942
		Total Rs.		371,100,768		455,886,954		460,047,107

- M/s Mian Babar Construction (SMC – Pvt) Ltd. quoted higher rate than the permissible limit of award of work, hence the tender cannot be awarded.
- Contractor given an undertaking regarding reduction in rates dated 20.04.2017.
- Action of contractor is against clause-57 captioned as “Limitation on negotiation” of PPRA rules which states that negotiation cannot be done with the contractor.
- Action of the contractor is contradictory to clause IB-22 captioned as “Modification, Substitution and withdrawal of bids” sub clause 22.3 of bidding document of the project, according to which no bid may be modified by a bidder after the deadline for submission of bids.
- The action of the contractor is also contradictory to clause IB-31 captioned as “Notification of Award” sub clause 31.2 of bidding document of the project according to which no negotiation with the bidder having evaluated as lowest responsive or any other bidder shall be permitted.

Package-H (Apartments)

Sr. No.	Description	Amount	As per Estimate		M/s Abid Brothers Contractors (Pvt) Ltd.		M/s Muhammad Rafiq Bhatti	
			Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount
1	<u>CIVIL WORKS</u>							
(a)	Schedule Items	125,633,443	160%	326,646,951	220%	402,027,017	199.90%	376,774,695
(b)	Non Schedule Items	3,711,242	0%	3,711,242	20%	4,453,491	1.85%	3,779,900
2	<u>PLUMBING WORKS</u>							
(a)	Schedule Items	4,699,468	160%	12,218,616	220%	15,038,296	199.90%	14,093,703
(b)	Non Schedule Items	3,962,927	0%	3,962,927	20%	4,755,513	1.85%	4,036,242
3	<u>ELECTRICAL WORKS</u>							
(a)	Schedule Items	7,592,746	160%	19,741,140	220%	24,296,788	199.90%	22,770,646
(b)	Non Schedule Items	2,880,000	0%	2,880,000	20%	3,456,000	1.85%	2,933,280
4	<u>GAS INSTALATION</u>							
(a)	Schedule Items	746,112	160%	1,939,891	220%	2,387,558	199.90%	2,237,590
		Total Rs.		371,100,768		456,414,663		426,626,056

M/s Muhammad Rafiq Bhatti is the lowest bidder and found eligible for award.

Package-I (Apartments)

Sr. No.	Description	Amount	As per Estimate		M/s Sargodha Group of Construction	
			Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount
1	CIVIL WORKS					
(a)	Schedule Items	104,694,536	160%	272,205,793	217%	331,881,678
(b)	Non Schedule Items	3,092,702	0%	3,092,702	17%	3,618,461
2	PLUMBING WORKS					
(a)	Schedule Items	3,916,223	160%	10,182,180	217%	12,414,427
(b)	Non Schedule Items	3,302,440	0%	3,302,440	17%	3,863,854
3	ELECTRICAL WORKS					
(a)	Schedule Items	6,327,288	160%	16,450,950	217%	20,057,504
(b)	Non Schedule Items	2,400,000	0%	2,400,000	17%	2,808,000
4	GAS INSTALATION					
(a)	Schedule Items	621,760	160%	1,616,576	217%	1,970,979
		Total Rs.		309,250,640		376,614,904

M/s Sargodha Group of Construction quoted higher rate than the permissible limit of award of work, hence the tender cannot be awarded.

Package-J (Apartments)

Sr. No.	Description	Amount	As per Estimate		M/s Zoraiz Engineers (Pvt) Ltd.		M/s Mian Babar Construction (SMC-Pvt) Ltd.	
			Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount
1	CIVIL WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	125,633,443	160%	326,646,951	223%	405,796,020	226%	409,565,023
(b)	Non Schedule Items	3,711,242	0%	3,711,242	15%	4,267,928	15%	4,267,928
2	PLUMBING WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	4,699,468	160%	12,218,616	223%	15,179,280	226%	15,320,264
(b)	Non Schedule Items	3,962,927	0%	3,962,927	15%	4,557,367	15%	4,557,367
3	ELECTRICAL WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	7,592,746	160%	19,741,140	223%	24,524,570	226%	24,752,352
(b)	Non Schedule Items	2,880,000	0%	2,880,000	15%	3,312,000	15%	3,312,000
4	GAS INSTALATION							
(a)	Schedule Items	746,112	160%	1,939,891	223%	2,409,942	226%	2,432,325
		Total Rs.		371,100,768		460,047,107		464,207,260

- M/s Zoraiz Engineers (Pvt) Ltd. quoted higher rate than the permissible limit of award of work, hence the tender cannot be awarded.
- Contractor given an undertaking on 26.04.2017 regarding reduction in rates & even after undertaking to reduce the rates, the bid amount is beyond the permissible limit of award.

Package-Q (Apartments)

Sr. No.	Description	Amount	As per Estimate		M/s Progressive International Engineers & Contractors		M/s Abid Brothers (Pvt) Ltd.	
			Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount
1	CIVIL WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	125,633,443	160%	326,646,951	199%	375,643,994	220%	402,027,017
(b)	Non Schedule Items	3,711,242	0%	3,711,242	15%	4,267,928	20%	4,453,491
2	PLUMBING WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	4,699,468	160%	12,218,616	199%	14,051,408	220%	15,038,296
(b)	Non Schedule Items	3,962,927	0%	3,962,927	15%	4,557,367	20%	4,755,513
3	ELECTRICAL WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	7,592,746	160%	19,741,140	199%	22,702,311	220%	24,296,788
(b)	Non Schedule Items	2,880,000	0%	2,880,000	15%	3,312,000	20%	3,456,000
4	GAS INSTALATION							
(a)	Schedule Items	746,112	160%	1,939,891	199%	2,230,875	220%	2,387,558
		Total Rs.		371,100,768		426,765,883		456,414,663

M/s Progressive International Engineers & Contractors is the lowest bidder and found eligible for award.

Package-R (Boys School, Girls School, Community Centre, Hostel Building, Maintenance Office)

S. No.	Description	Amount	As per Estimate		M/s Abid Brothers Contractors (Pvt) Ltd.		M/s Muhammad Rafique Bhatti		M/s Construction Group	
			Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount
1	CIVIL WORKS									
(a)	Schedule Items	125,209,380	160%	325,544,388	210%	388,149,078	223%	404,426,298	225%	406,930,485
(b)	Non Schedule Items	13,820,543	0%	13,820,543	5%	14,511,570	18%	16,308,241	20%	16,584,651
2	PLUMBING WORKS									
(a)	Schedule Items	3,918,577	160%	10,188,300	75%	6,857,510	223%	12,657,004	225%	12,735,375
(b)	Non Schedule Items	3,060,375	0%	3,060,375	5%	3,213,394	18%	3,611,242	20%	3,672,450
3	ELECTRICAL WORKS									
(a)	Schedule Items	5,672,933	160%	14,749,626	74%	9,870,904	223%	18,323,574	225%	18,437,033
(b)	Non Schedule Items	1,075,500	0%	1,075,500	0%	1,075,500	18%	1,269,090	20%	1,290,600
	Total Rs.			368,438,732		423,677,955		456,595,448		459,650,594

M/s Abid Brothers Contractors (Pvt) Ltd. is the lowest bidder and found eligible for award.

Package-T (Road Network, External Development)

Sr. No.	Description	Amount	As per Estimate		M/s Mian Babar Construction (SMC-Pvt) Ltd.		M/s M. Asad Contractors (Pvt) Ltd.	
			Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount	Rate	Amount
ROADS SYSTEM								
1	CIVIL WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	1,785,688	160%	4,642,788	220%	5,714,200	198.90%	5,337,420
(b)	Non Schedule Items	133,278,696	0%	133,278,696	15%	153,270,501	15.00%	153,270,501
EXTERNAL DEVELOPMENT								
1	CIVIL WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	54,319,218	160%	141,229,966	220%	173,821,496	198.15%	161,952,747
(b)	Non Schedule Items	89,457,205	0%	89,457,205	15%	102,875,786	15.50%	103,323,072
2	ELECTRICAL WORKS							
(a)	Schedule Items	2,141,692	160%	5,568,398	220%	6,853,413	199.00%	6,403,658
	Total Rs.			374,177,053		442,535,396		430,287,398

M/s M. Asad & Co. is the lowest bidder and found eligible for award.

DIRECTOR WORKS